

Concise Minutes – Economy, Trade, and Rural Affairs Committee

Meeting Venue:

Committee Rooms 1&2, Senedd

Meeting date: Thursday, 23 March 2023

Meeting time: 09.30 – 12.05

This meeting can be viewed

on [Senedd TV](#) at:

<http://senedd.tv/en/13306>

On-site

Attendance

Category	Names
Members of the Senedd:	Darren Millar MS (Temporary Chair) Hefin David MS Luke Fletcher MS Vikki Howells MS Samuel Kurtz MS Sarah Murphy MS
Witnesses:	Lesley Griffiths MS, Minister for Rural Affairs and North Wales, and Trefnydd Mark Alexander, Welsh Government Dorian Brunt, Welsh Government Emma Davies, Welsh Government Hannah Fernandez, Welsh Government
Committee Staff:	Lara Date, Clerk Rob Donovan, Clerk Evan Jones, Deputy Clerk



	<p>Ceri Thomas, Committee Support Officer</p> <p>Masudah Ali, Legal Adviser</p> <p>Jennifer Cottle, Legal Adviser</p> <p>Sam Mason, Legal Adviser</p> <p>Gruffydd Owen, Legal Adviser</p> <p>Katie Wyatt, Legal Adviser</p> <p>Elfyn Henderson, Researcher</p> <p>Katy Orford, Researcher</p> <p>Catherine McKeag, Communications</p> <p>Sara Rees, Record of Proceedings</p> <p>Rhys Wynne, Record of Proceedings</p>
--	--

1 Introductions, apologies, substitutions and declarations of interest

1.1 The Chair welcomed everyone to the meeting.

1.2 Samuel Kurtz MS declared he was an honorary member of the British Veterinary Association.

2 Agriculture (Wales) Bill – Stage 2 Consideration

In accordance with Standing Order 26.21, the Committee disposed of the following amendments to the Bill:

Amendment 57 (Luke Fletcher)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Luke Fletcher	Hefin David	
Samuel Kurtz	Vikki Howells	
Darren Millar	Sarah Murphy	

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 57 was not agreed.

Amendment 1A (Luke Fletcher MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Luke Fletcher	Hefin David	
Samuel Kurtz	Vikki Howells	
Darren Millar	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 1A was not agreed.		

Amendment 1 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Luke Fletcher	Hefin David	
Samuel Kurtz	Vikki Howells	
Darren Millar	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 1 was not agreed.		

Amendment 43 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 43 was not agreed.		

Amendment 2 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 2 was not agreed.		

Amendment 3 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Luke Fletcher	Vikki Howells	
Darren Millar	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 3 was not agreed.		

Amendment 29 (Lesley Griffiths MS) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 4 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Luke Fletcher	Vikki Howells	
Darren Millar	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 4 was not agreed.		

Amendment 5 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 5 was not agreed.		

Amendment 58 (Luke Fletcher MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Luke Fletcher	Hefin David	
Samuel Kurtz	Vikki Howells	
Darren Millar	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 58 was not agreed.		

Amendment 44 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 44 was not agreed.		

Amendment 6 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 6 was not agreed.		

Amendment 7 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 7 was not agreed.		

Amendment 45 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 45 was not agreed.		

Amendment 46 (Samuel Kurtz MS) was withdrawn

Amendment 8 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 8 was not agreed.		

Amendment 9 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Luke Fletcher	Vikki Howells	
Darren Millar	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 9 was not agreed.		

Amendment 30A (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 30A was not agreed.		

Amendment 30 (Lesley Griffiths MS) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 10 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 10 was not agreed.		

Amendment 11 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 11 was not agreed.		

Amendment 12 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 12 was not agreed.

Amendment 13 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 13 was not agreed.		

Amendment 47 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 47 was not agreed.		

Amendment 31 (Lesley Griffiths MS) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 14 (Samuel Kurtz MS) was withdrawn

Amendment 15 (Samuel Kurtz MS) was withdrawn

Amendment 16 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 16 was not agreed.		

Amendment 17 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 17 was not agreed.		

Amendment 48 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 48 was not agreed.		

Amendment 49 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain

Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 49 was not agreed.		

Amendment 50 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 50 was not agreed.		

Amendment 51 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 51 was not agreed.		

Amendment 52 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	

Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 52 was not agreed.		

Amendment 53 (Joel James MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 53 was not agreed.		

Amendment 54 (Samuel Kurtz MS) was withdrawn

Amendment 55 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 55 was not agreed.		

Amendment 59 (Luke Fletcher MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Luke Fletcher	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	

Samuel Kurtz	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 59 was not agreed.		

Amendment 18 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 18 was not agreed.		

Amendment 32 (Lesley Griffiths MS) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 19 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 19 was not agreed.		

Amendment 33 (Lesley Griffiths MS) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 34 (Lesley Griffiths MS) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 20 (Samuel Kurtz MS) was withdrawn.

Amendment 21 (Samuel Kurtz MS) was withdrawn.

Amendment 23 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
	Sarah Murphy	
	Luke Fletcher	
Amendment 23 was not agreed.		

Amendment 24 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
	Sarah Murphy	
	Luke Fletcher	
Amendment 24 was not agreed.		

Amendment 25 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
	Sarah Murphy	

	Luke Fletcher	
Amendment 25 was not agreed.		

Amendment 22 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
	Sarah Murphy	
	Luke Fletcher	
Amendment 22 was not agreed.		

Amendment 35 (Lesley Griffiths MS) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 26 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 26 was not agreed.		

Amendment 27 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	

Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 27 was not agreed.		

Amendment 36 (Lesley Griffiths MS) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 28 (Samuel Kurtz MS)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Samuel Kurtz	Hefin David	
Darren Millar	Vikki Howells	
Luke Fletcher	Sarah Murphy	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 28 was not agreed.		

Amendment 37 (Lesley Griffiths MS) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 38 (Lesley Griffiths MS) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 39 (Lesley Griffiths MS) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 40 (Lesley Griffiths MS) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 41 (Lesley Griffiths MS) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 42 (Lesley Griffiths MS) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 56 (Luke Fletcher MS) was withdrawn.

3 Motion under Standing Order 17.42(ix) to resolve to exclude the public from the remainder of the meeting and the meeting on 26 April

3.1 The Motion to exclude the public for the remainder of the meeting and the meeting on 26 April was agreed.

4 Food (Wales) Bill: Key issues paper

4.1 The Committee considered the Food (Wales) Bill key issues paper.